

ABSTRACT

Keywords: anthrax, *Bacillus anthracis*, disease control and management, maggot,

putrefaction, scavenger, spore.

INTRODUCTION

 toxin and capsule production, a process known to be negatively linked to sporulation (5, 12, 13).

 Upon host death anaerobic putrefying bacteria from the gastrointestinal tract also begin the process of decomposition (14). These bacteria may inhibit sporulation by antagonizing vegetative *B. anthracis* cells. Support for this comes from early experimental work indicating that vegetative reproduction occurred in a variety of media as long as they were sterilized (7, 15), that sporulation in blood taken from experimentally infected anthrax carcasses was greatly reduced when exposed to contaminated air (16), and that the *B. anthracis* vegetative cell population diminished at the onset of putrefaction (17, 18). Processes, such as terminal hemorrhaging and scavenging, that release *B. anthracis*-laden blood into the aerobic environment, provide an escape from microbial competition with anaerobes. Given the above body of evidence, it is commonly held that "if the carcass is not opened the anaerobic decomposition and acidification will kill the contained vegetative cells within 4 days resulting in minimal environmental contamination" (5), with this time window extrapolated from experiments suggesting that *B. anthracis* vegetative cells sporulate or die within 72 hours of host death (16, 19, 20). To our knowledge, however, only anecdotal evidence exists supporting the inability of vegetative cells to survive or sporulate in unopened carcasses (1, 2, 5, 21–26). Nevertheless, scavenging is frequently considered to play a critical role in the production of spores at carcass sites. The single study to empirically assess the relationship between scavengers and spore production found no significant difference between spore contamination at two carcasses, one of which was minimally scavenged while the other had been fully scavenged (27).

METHODS

Study area

This study was conducted on the Okaukuejo plains of ENP where anthrax is seasonally

endemic and causes significant mortality in zebra (*Equus quagga)*, springbok (*Antidorcas*

marsupialis), elephant (*Loxodonta africanus*), wildebeest (*Connochaetes taurinus*), and

occasionally other herbivores (20). The carrion produced by anthrax deaths feeds a

- diverse assemblage of vertebrate scavengers including most frequently black-backed
- jackal (*Canis mesomelas*), spotted hyena (*Crocuta crocuta*), white-backed vulture (*Gyps*
- *africanus*), lappet-faced-vulture (*Torgos tracheliotos*), marabou storks (*Leptoptilos*
- *crumeniferus*) and occasionally lion (*Panthera leo*), black crows (*Corvus capensis*), pied

crows (*Corvus albus*), and various other raptor species (20, 31, 32).

Carcass inclusion criteria and randomization

 Zebra carcasses found between March 2009 and March 2010 were eligible for inclusion in the study if they were found on the date of death (which could be determined 121 accurately due to a separate camera trap study of carcass consumption rates (31)), they were entirely unscavenged or had only minor openings by scavengers at the anus, eye, or abdomen and the probable cause of death was anthrax as determined by blood smear microscopy, terminal hemorrhaging, lack of clotting, and absence of any other suspected cause of death (*i.e.* predation signs). Anthrax diagnosis was later confirmed via selective bacterial culture (29) and confirmation of possession of pXO1 and pXO2 plasmids (33). Eligible carcasses were assigned to treatments using block randomization in blocks of eight where blocks were determined by date of death and were used to ensure even distribution of carcasses in case of small sample size. Initially, only zebra carcasses were considered for inclusion. Due to the rarity of fresh carcasses, inclusion criteria were modified in May 2009 to allow other herbivore carcasses to be eligible for inclusion if they fitted the above criteria.

Electrified cage exclosures

 To experimentally exclude all vertebrate scavengers from carcasses we built an electrified cage exclosure (Figure 1). The exclosure was constructed from six 3 x 1.2 m farm gates (four as sidewalls and two used as roofs) covered in diamond mesh fencing. A skirt of chicken wire was then wrapped around the sides to prevent intrusion by digging. Four electric fencing wires (two pairs of positive and grounded wires 1cm apart) were offset 10cm from the sidewalls at 30 cm and 70cm above the ground and powered to 6-8 kV by an energizer (125 A 12 V model, MEPS Electric Fence Systems, South Africa) run 141 off of a deep cycle car battery attached to the exclosure roof.

Sampling procedure

 After following routine protocol for anthrax diagnostics in Etosha National Park (sterile throat swabs in the nasal turbinates), two 0.5 m metal fence stakes were inserted into the ground on an axis running from the mouth to the anus, 2 m from the animal on either side. The carcass location was mapped out on a coordinate system based on these stakes, noting locations saturated by terminally hemorrhaged blood and non-hemorrhagic fluid. Soil was then collected from: (1) soil stained by blood from terminal hemorrhaging; (2) unstained soil within a 1 m radius of the carcass; (3) unstained soil within a 3 m radius of the carcass; and (4) soil stained by non-hemorrhagic fluid. For most carcasses, however, the latter region was not evident on the date of death and only mapped and 152 sampled at later occasions. Soil samples at 50 m away from the carcass were collected as negative controls for cross-contamination. All soil was collected from the surface (< 1 cm deep) using sterile spoons. To reduce the variance due to spatial heterogeneity, each sample was comprised of twenty 5-10 g sub-samples distributed randomly throughout the sample area. Fewer sub-samples were taken when the area to be sampled was

 prohibitively small. Following sampling, exclosures were deployed on carcasses assigned to the exclosure group.

 Carcasses were resampled again 4 days after death. For carcasses in the exclosure group, the exclosure was removed during this visit to permit resampling and to allow scavenging to commence. Carcasses were then re-sampled 8-11 days after death and again at approximately 1, 6, and 12 months after death. Not all carcasses were sampled at all sample intervals due to logistical constraints. Samples were immediately frozen at -20 °C and then later thawed, mixed to homogenize subsamples, and aliquoted into 5 g samples. The spore quantification assay was conducted as follows. After weighing sterile 2 ml eppendorf tubes to which 1 ml sterile deionized water (SDW) had been added, approximately 0.5 g of a sample was added to each tube and the tubes weighed again. 169 The tubes were then vortexed strongly and put in heating block at 65 \degree C for 15 min. 170 Following further vortexing, 10^{-1} and 10^{-2} dilutions (0.1 ml transferred to 0.9 ml SDW in 2 ml eppendorfs) were made and 0.1 ml volumes of these and of the undiluted sample were spread on duplicate trimethoprim-sulfamethoxazole polymyxin blood agar (TSPBA) and, initially, polymyxin-lysozyme-EDTA-thallous acetate agar (PLET) plates (2). Later it became apparent that agreement between TSPBA and PLET was good and use of PLET was discontinued. Colony counts on TSPBA plates were determined after 176 overnight incubation at 36 ± 1 °C and those on PLET after 36-48 h incubation, also at 36 177 ± 1 °C. Those performing the laboratory assays blinded to each samples' metadata and all spore densities were quantified in duplicate, with duplicates averaged to yield the final spore densities analyzed averaged.

Statistical Analysis

 We fitted a generalized additive mixed model (GAMM) using the R package 'gamm4' to spore density data to assess the effect of experimental exclusion of scavengers as well as to determine how spore density varied spatially and temporally (34). Based on a preliminary exploration of residual plots, we chose to fit log(spore density) with a Poisson link function and each carcass modeled as a random effect. We modeled experimental group as a fixed effect with no interactions. We used a sampling occasion by sample area interaction smoothing term to flexibly model distinct temporal trends in spore density for each sample area. We chose a smoother of basis 4 using Akaike's Information Criterion. Given our small carcass sample size, our primary analysis included all carcasses regardless of species and soil type but conducted a sensitivity analysis fitting the same model but excluding data from carcasses of outlying species or at outlying soil types. While several other environmental factors are known to be relevant to sporulation and survival (i.e., temperature, UV radiation, humidity, and rainfall), we were unable to include them in our analysis because diurnal and seasonal variations within sites varied far more than any variations between sites.

-
-

RESULTS

 Seven zebra, one springbok, and one wildebeest carcass were included in this study. Four zebra carcasses were in the exclosure treatment, while the rest of the carcasses were in the control group. All caged carcasses were entirely unscavenged except one that had minor openings at the abdomen and anus. All nine carcasses were anthrax positive as confirmed by culture and genetic diagnostics. However, none of the soil samples taken from the springbok carcass contained *B. anthracis* spores and were therefore excluded from the analysis. All carcasses included in the study were located in the same soil type except for one outlier (soil C5 is a carbonate-rich loamy regosol/leptosol of aeolian origin, and D2 is carbonate-rich eutric-free fluvisol; see (35) for more details).

 The fitted GAMM is displayed along with sample spore densities (averaged between duplicates) in Figure 2 on a log(spg) scale with the tabular data provided as an online supplementary file. The estimated coefficient (95% Wald confidence interval) associated with the exclosure treatment was 0.30 (-0.16, 0.75), indicating that the average effect of excluding scavenger increased spore density, though this was not statistically 213 significant ($p > 0.05$). This result did not qualitatively differ when performing the same analysis but excluding the single wildebeest carcass (0.31 (-0.24, .86)), considering the partially scavenged, caged carcass to be in the control group (0.030 (-0.56, .62)), or excluding the carcass in outlying soil type (0.23, (-0.41, 0.86)). The fitted smoother functions of spore density over time differed among sample areas. In soil stained by terminally hemorrhaged blood, *B. anthracis* spore density generally increased from about 0-100 spores per gram (spg) on the date of death to about 10^5 -10⁸ spg 4 days later. Between 4 days to 8 days post-death spore density in these samples increased again by factors ranging from 1.9-53 at four of six sites. Spore density then generally decayed over the next 1-6 months but displayed a slight increase in many samples after a year. In the 1m radius samples, spore density began at 0-100 spg and 224 displayed an increasing trend over time, though never increasing greater than 10^5 spg except for one outlier. The 3m radius samples rarely contained spores and never

the similarity in spore concentrations between experimental treatment groups since

comparable or greater spore densities were already found in samples at the 4-day sample

(i.e., before scavenging could have occurred in the exclosure group).

 Thus, the absence of any significant quantitative differences and apparent qualitative similarity between experimentally caged and control carcasses for the first 4 days after host death is at odds with the long-held view that scavenging plays a significant role in *B. anthracis* spore contamination at carcass sites. While our sample size was small due to the logistical difficulties associated with locating fresh anthrax carcasses before vertebrate scavengers arrive, the similar spore concentrations at even a few caged carcasses suggests that carcasses do not need to be opened by vertebrate scavengers for large-scale spore production to occur.

 If extravasation of carcass fluids indeed plays an important role in environmental spore contamination, then scavengers' disarticulation and movement of carcasses may reduce contamination around the original carcass site with compensatory contamination of satellite sites, which were not sampled in our study. However, satellite site contamination levels are likely to reflect those found in our 1 m or 3 m radius sampling zones (in which carcass materials were also dragged and eaten) which exhibited much 266 lower levels of contamination ($\leq 10^5$ spg) compared to soil saturated in blood or other 267 carcass fluids (up to 10^8 spg, respectively).

 The consistently high spore densities found in soil saturated by non-hemorrhagic carcass fluid was an unexpected result, particularly at caged carcasses given the common assumption that *B. anthracis* vegetative cells would not be able to exit unscavenged carcasses except via terminal hemorrhaging. Extravasation of liquid from the carcass can

 only occur from natural orifices except to the extent by which the skin is ruptured (14). That unscavenged, caged carcasses exhibited substantial visible areas of soil clearly saturated by carcass fluids suggests that vertebrate scavenging is not necessary for skin to rupture (Figure 1). Carter and Tibbett (14) note that both the bloating caused by gases produced via anaerobic metabolism during putrefaction and maggot feeding activity are capable of independently rupturing carcass skin. In addition to allowing carcass fluid to purge into the soil, skin ruptures also allow air into the carcass and may thereby facilitate sporulation both inside and outside the carcass. While we do not know the timescale at which ruptures occurred in our study, it is clear that a substantial population of vegetative *B. anthracis* cells survived the putrefactive phase up until skin rupture or sporulated beforehand.

 Our exclusion of vertebrate scavengers permitted a substantial increase in blowfly activity at caged carcasses (Figure 1), which may have compensated for the formers' role in opening the carcass and facilitating *B. anthracis* spore production. However, bloating alone (i.e. without maggot activity) may be sufficient to rupture skin, depending on temperature and skin thickness. Blowflies have been suspected to play an important role in anthrax transmission in Kruger National Park, South Africa, due to their propensity to ingest material at carcass sites and then regurgitate it on vegetation at heights preferred by the browsing species most frequently infected in that system (36, 37). In ENP, however, while we observed similar blowfly feeding preferences (but far fewer flies), the outbreaks occur primarily in grazers and appear more likely to be due to direct ingestion of contaminated soil (6, 20).

 Soil spore density persisted in all sample types, though with varying consistency as found in previous studies (20). While contamination levels generally decreased in the months following host death, samples from fluid-saturated soil still occasionally 297 exhibited densities as high as 10^5 -10⁶ spg a year after host death. Slight increases in contamination levels found in soil within a 1 m radius around the carcass is likely due to mixture of fluid-saturated soil and nearby soil over the course of the year, or simply an artifact of sampling noise, though we cannot exclude vegetative reproduction in the soil. Given the logistical limitations of a field experiment, we were unable to assess several other relevant factors affecting spore production and distribution. Temperature affects both vegetative cell survival and sporulation efficiency (16). Ambient temperatures during the first 8 days after carcass death were in the range allowing sporulation (15-38°C), but varied more with time of day than between carcasses and thus we were unable to include this in our analysis. Further, carcass and ambient temperatures may differ substantially, in large part due to heat generated by maggot activity (38). In addition to soil spore density in each of the four sample areas, the exposure risk to susceptible hosts will additionally depend on the area of contamination and a host's behavioral propensity to approach that area (6). The area of fluid-saturated soil changes dynamically while the carcass is consumed, and may be distributed at satellite sites by scavengers. Soil that has been incidentally contaminated via movement of carcass materials will cover an even wider area and is even more difficult to measure but will have much lower soil spore density, which may render it irrelevant to the transmission process.

Conclusion

 By comparing spore concentrations at experimentally caged and unmanipulated naturally occurring anthrax carcasses, we demonstrate that vertebrate scavengers do not play a critical role in the sporulation process of *B. anthracis*. Our results also suggest that contamination of soil by fluid purged from carcasses via putrefactive bloating or maggot activity exhibit soil spore densities close to those in blood-saturated soil. We thus suggest that anthrax control measures aimed at deterring scavengers to prevent sporulation appear unwarranted.

-
-

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

 We thank the Namibian Ministry of Environment and Tourism for permission to do this research, the Directorate of Parks, Wildlife and Management for permission to work throughout Etosha, and the staff in the Directorate of Scientific Services at the Etosha Ecological Institute for logistic support and assistance. We give a special thanks to Shayne Kötting, Martina Küsters, Zepee Havarua, Werner Kilian and Wilferd Versfeld, for all their help keeping our research program running smoothly. Finally, we thank Elizabeth Blaschke for her laboratory assistance and Wendy Turner and Holly Ganz for feedback on the manuscript. This research was supported by the Chang-Lin Tien Environmental Fellowship, Andrew and Mary Thompson Rocca Scholarships, the Edna and Yoshinori Tanada Fellowship to S.E.B., German Research Foundation (DFG) grant BE 2157/3-1 to W.B., and James S. McDonnell grant and NIH grant GM83863 to W.M.G, and National Institute of General Medical Sciences MIDAS grant U01GM087719 to Lauren A. Meyers.

- 406 25. **Gates CC, Elkin BT, Dragon DC**. 2001. Anthrax, p. . In Williams, ES, Barker, IK 407 (eds.), Infectious Diseases of Wild MammalsThird Edit. Iowa State Press.
- 408 26. **Clegg SB, Turnbull PC, Foggin CM, Lindeque PM**. 2007. Massive outbreak of 409 **anthrax** in wildlife in the Malilangwe Wildlife Reserve, Zimbabwe. Veterinary 410 Record, 2007/01/30 ed. **160**:113–118.
- 411 27. **Dragon DC, Bader DE, Mitchell J, Woollen N**. 2005. Natural dissemination of 412 Bacillus anthracis spores in northern Canada. Applied and Environmental 413 Microbiology **71**:1610–1615.
- 414 28. **Houston DC, Cooper JE.** 1975. The digestive tract of the white-back griffon 415 vulture and its role in disease transmission among wild ungulates. Journal of 416 Wildlife Diseases **11**:306–313.
- 417 29. Lindeque P. 1991. Factors affecting the incidence of anthrax in the Etosha 418 National Park, Namibia. Council for National Academic Awards. Okaukuejo.
- 419 30. Gates CC, Elkin BT, Dragon DC. 1995. Investigation, Control and 420 **Epizootiology of Anthrax in a Geographically Isolated, Free-Roaming Bison** 421 Population in Northern Canada. Canadian Journal of Veterinary Research-422 Revue Canadienne De Recherche Veterinaire **59**:256–264.
- 423 31. **Bellan SE, Gimenez O, Choquet R, Getz WM**. 2013. A Hierarchical Distance 424 Sampling Approach to Estimating Mortality Rates from Opportunistic Carcass 425 Surveillance Data. Methods in Ecology and Evolution.
- 32. **Bellan SE, Cizauskas CA, Miyen J, Ebersohn K, K√o** 426 **sters M, Prager KC, Van** 427 **Vuuren M, Sabeta CT, Getz WM**. 2012. Black-backed jackal exposure to 428 rabies virus, canine distemper virus, and Bacillus anthracis in Etosha National 429 Park, Namibia. Journal of Wildlife Diseases **48**:371–381.
- 430 33. Beyer W, Bellan S, Eberle G, Ganz HH, Getz WM, Haumacher R, Hilss KA, 431 **Kilian W, Lazak J, Turner WC, Turnbull PCB**. 2012. Distribution and 432 Molecular Evolution of Bacillus anthracis Genotypes in Namibia. PLoS Negl 433 Trop Dis **6**:e1534.
- 434 34. **Zuur AF**. 2009. GLMM and GAMM, p. 574 p. In Mixed effects models and 435 extensions in ecology with R. Springer, New York; London.
- 436 35. **Beugler-Bell H, Buch MW.** 1997. Soils and soil erosion in the Etosha National 437 Park, northern Namibia. Madoqua **20**:91–104.
- 438 36. **Braack LEO, De Vos V**. 1987. Seasonal Abundance of Carrion-Frequenting 439 Blow-Flies (Diptera, Calliphoridae) in the Kruger-National-Park. 440 Onderstepoort Journal of Veterinary Research 54:591-597.
- 441 37. **Braack LEO, De Vos V**. 1990. Feeding-Habits and Flight Range of Blow-Flies 442 (Chrysomyia Spp) in Relation to Anthrax Transmission in the Kruger-443 National-Park, South-Africa. Onderstepoort Journal of Veterinary Research 444 **57**:141–142.
- 445 38. **Anderson GS, Van Laerhoven SL**. 1996. Initial studies on insect succession 446 on carrion in southwestern British Columbia. Journal of Forensic Sciences 447 **41**:617–625.
- 448
- 449

 Figure 1. The site of an anthrax-positive zebra carcass that has been experimentally caged from the date of death is shown on the date of death (A) and 4 days afterwards after substantial bloating and when the cage was removed (B). A close-up of the same carcass (C) better displays the soil saturated by non-hemorrhagic fluid (the blackened disturbed area surrounding the carcass), which exhibited high levels of *B. anthracis* spore contamination. A carcass that had been slightly opened prior to caging (D) exhibited a larger area of soil saturated by non-hemorrhagic fluid as well as substantial maggot activity 4 days after host death.

461 **Figure 2.** Spores per gram plotted on a log scale by days since carcass death,

 experimental exclosure (black) or control (red) treatments, and sample area (with panels showing results for soil collected from hemorrhagic fluid-stained soil, soil unstained by carcass fluid taken from within a 1m and 3m radius of the carcass, and soil stained by non-hemorrhagic fluid). Each solid line is from a single carcass, with points representing samples. The dashed lines show generalized additive mixed model fitted to the data. Carcasses in the 'exclosure' treatment were excluded from vertebrate scavenging up until second sample (4 days after death) while 'control' carcasses were unmanipulated. The asterisks represent a carcass in the exclosure treatment group that had been scavenged for approximately an hour prior to being caged. All carcasses were plains zebra except for

indicated by the legend.